

An Introduction to
Formal Logic

Second edition

Peter Smith

February 27, 2019

© Peter Smith 2018. Not for re-posting or re-circulation.

Comments and corrections please to ps218 at cam dot ac dot uk

Contents

1	What is deductive logic?	1
1.1	What is an argument?	1
1.2	Kinds of evaluation	1
1.3	Deduction vs. induction	2
1.4	Just a few more examples	4
1.5	Generalizing	5
1.6	Summary	7
	Exercises 1	7
2	Validity and soundness	9
2.1	Validity defined	9
2.2	Consistency, validity, and equivalence	11
2.3	Validity, truth, and the invalidity principle	12
2.4	Inferences and arguments	14
2.5	‘Valid’ vs ‘true’	15
2.6	What’s the use of deduction?	15
2.7	An illuminating circle?	17
2.8	Summary	18
	Exercises 2	18
3	Forms of inference	20
3.1	More forms of inference	20
3.2	Four basic points about the use of schemas	22
3.3	Arguments can instantiate many patterns	24
3.4	Summary	26
	Exercises 3	26
4	Proofs	27
4.1	Proofs: first examples	27
4.2	Fully annotated proofs	28
4.3	Glimpsing an ideal	30
4.4	Deductively cogent multi-step arguments	31
4.5	Indirect arguments	33
4.6	Summary	35
	Exercises 4	36

ii	Contents
5	The counterexample method 37
5.1	‘But you might as well argue . . . ’ 37
5.2	The counterexample method, more carefully 38
5.3	A ‘quantifier shift’ fallacy 39
5.4	Summary 41
	Exercises 5 41
6	Logical validity 42
6.1	Topic neutrality 42
6.2	Logical validity, at last 43
6.3	Logical necessity 45
6.4	The boundaries of logical validity? 45
6.5	Definitions of validity as rational reconstructions 46
6.6	Summary 48
	Exercises 6 48
7	Propositions and forms 49
7.1	Types vs tokens 49
7.2	Sense vs tone 49
7.3	Are propositions sentences? 50
7.4	Are propositions truth-relevant contents? 51
7.5	Why we can be indecisive 52
7.6	Forms of inference again 53
7.7	Summary 54
	<i>Interlude: From informal to formal logic</i> 55
8	Three connectives 57
8.1	Two simple arguments 57
8.2	‘And’ 58
8.3	‘Or’ 59
8.4	‘Not’ 61
8.5	Scope 62
8.6	Formalization 63
8.7	The design brief for PL languages 64
8.8	One PL language 66
8.9	Summary 67
	Exercises 8 67
9	PL syntax 69
9.1	Syntactic rules for PL languages 69
9.2	Constructional histories, parse trees 71
9.3	Wffs have unique parse trees! 73
9.4	Main connectives, subformulas, scope 74
9.5	Bracketing styles 76
9.6	Summary 76
	Exercises 9 77

Contents	iii
10 PL semantics	78
10.1 Interpreting wffs	78
10.2 Languages and translation	80
10.3 Atomic wffs are true or false	81
10.4 Truth values	82
10.5 Truth tables for the connectives	83
10.6 Evaluating molecular wffs: two examples	84
10.7 Uniqueness and bivalence	85
10.8 Short working	86
10.9 Aside: the very idea of a formalized language	89
10.10 Summary	89
Exercises 10	90
11 'P's, 'Q's, ' α 's, ' β 's – and form again	91
11.1 Styles of variable: object languages and metalanguages	91
11.2 Basic quotation conventions	92
11.3 To Quine-quote or not to Quine-quote	95
11.4 Why Greek-letter variables?	96
11.5 The idea of form, again	97
11.6 Summary	98
Exercises 11	98
12 Truth functions	99
12.1 Truth-functional vs other connectives	99
12.2 Functions and truth functions	100
12.3 Truth tables for wffs	101
12.4 'Possible valuations'	105
12.5 Summary	107
Exercises 12	107
13 Expressive adequacy	108
13.1 Exclusive disjunction	108
13.2 Another example: expressing the 'dollar' truth function	109
13.3 Expressive adequacy defined	110
13.4 Some more adequacy results	111
13.5 Summary	112
Exercises 13	113
14 Tautologies	114
14.1 Tautologies and contradictions	114
14.2 Generalizing examples of tautologies	116
14.3 Tautologies, necessity, and form	117
14.4 Tautologies as analytically true	119
14.5 Summary	119
Exercises 14	120
15 Tautological entailment	121

15.1	Three introductory examples	121
15.2	Tautological entailment defined	123
15.3	Tautological validity and logical validity	124
15.4	Brute-force truth-table testing	125
15.5	More examples	126
15.6	Extending the notion of tautological entailment	128
15.7	Tautological consistency and tautological validity	129
15.8	Summary	130
	Exercises 15	131
16	More about tautological entailment	132
16.1	A more efficient test?	132
16.2	Truth-table testing and the counterexample method	133
16.3	' \models ' and ' \therefore '	134
16.4	Generalizing examples of tautological entailment	135
16.5	Tautological entailment and form	136
16.6	Explosion!	137
16.7	A slightly different definition of tautological entailment	137
16.8	Tautological equivalence as two-way entailment	139
16.9	Summary	140
	Exercises 16	141
17	The truth-functional conditional	142
17.1	Some arguments involving conditionals	142
17.2	Four basic principles	143
17.3	Introducing the truth-functional conditional	144
17.4	Ways in which ' \rightarrow ' is conditional-like	145
17.5	'Only if' (and the biconditional)	148
17.6	Extended PL syntax and semantics, officially	150
17.7	' \rightarrow ' versus ' \models ' and ' \therefore '	152
17.8	Summary	153
	Exercises 17	154
18	'If's and ' \rightarrow 's	155
18.1	Types of conditional	155
18.2	Simple conditionals as truth-functional: for	156
18.3	Another kind of case where 'if' is truth-functional	158
18.4	Simple conditionals as truth-functional: against	159
18.5	Three responses	160
18.6	Adopting the material conditional	161
18.7	Summary	163
	Exercises 18	163
	<i>Interlude: Why natural deduction?</i>	164
19	PL proofs: conjunction and negation	168
19.1	Rules for conjunction	168

Contents	v
19.2 Rules for negation	170
19.3 A double negation rule	173
19.4 ‘Availability’	175
19.5 Proof discovery	177
19.6 Explosion again	178
19.7 Summary	180
Exercises 19	181
20 PL proofs: disjunction	182
20.1 The iteration rule	182
20.2 Introducing and eliminating disjunctions	183
20.3 More examples	187
20.4 Liberalizing the elimination rule	189
20.5 Reviewing the disjunction rules	192
20.6 Theorems	193
20.7 Excluded middle and double negation	195
20.8 Summary	196
Exercises 20	196
21 PL proofs: conditionals	197
21.1 Rules for the conditional	197
21.2 More proofs with conditionals	200
21.3 The material conditional again	203
21.4 Two more examples	203
21.5 Summary	205
Exercises 21	205
22 PL proofs: metatheory	206
22.1 Metatheory	206
22.2 Putting everything together	207
22.3 Vacuous discharge	210
22.4 Generalizing proofs	212
22.5 ‘ \models ’ and ‘ \vdash ’	212
22.6 Soundness and completeness	214
22.7 How to prove soundness	215
22.8 How to prove completeness	217
22.9 Summary	219
Exercises 22	219
<i>Interlude: Inferentialism, intuitionism</i>	220